In his piece *The Role of Theory in Aesthetics*, Weitz famously argues that an essential definition for art is not forthcoming. Weitz lays out a two-pronged attack, where he appeals to a Wittgensteinian concept skepticism, and notes the many counterexamples given to past proposed definitions. In a recent work called *Weitz’s Legacy*, Boardman argues that the pessimism in finding an essential definition for art is unwarranted. I will analyze Boardman’s claims, provide my own novel criticism of Weitz’s arguments, and finally show why Boardman’s historical account of pessimism is perhaps inaccurate.